

**Scientific Integrity Report Card**  
**Department of Energy**

<b>Scientific Integrity Grading Rubric</b>	<b>Total Possible:</b> 100 Points	<b>Total Awarded:</b> 25 Points
<b>Scientific Misconduct</b>	<b>Subsection Total: 40</b>	<b>Subsection Total: 6</b>
A. Political Manipulation of Science	6	3
B. Breadth of Coverage	5	3
C. Whistleblower Protection	12	0
D. Investigations of Complaints	6	0
E. Investigation Independent from Chain of Command	6	0
F. Sanctions for Misconduct	6	0
<b>Public Communications of Science</b>	<b>Subsection Total: 40</b>	<b>Subsection Total: 14</b>
A. Process for scientist to publish or lecture regarding their official work with the general public, in external peer-reviewed journals or at scientific conferences	10	2
B. Absence of policy review or agency screening for the above	10	2
C. Ability of scientists to review press releases regarding their work prior to final publication	10	0
D. Explicit provision for agency scientists to be on governing and editorial boards of scientific societies	10	10
<b>Transparency of Policy Decision-Making</b>	<b>Subsection Total: 20</b>	<b>Subsection Total: 5</b>
A. Requirement that all agency policy decisions must be based on science subjected to external peer review	10	5
B. Original research documents are part of administrative record	10	0

**I. Scientific Misconduct – (6/40 pts)**

**A. Political Manipulation of Science (3/6 pts)**

1. *Prohibits alteration of technical/scientific documents for non-technical reasons (3/3 pts)*

“Political officials will not suppress or alter scientific or technological findings”

2. *Prohibits intimidation or coercion to alter scientific data/analysis/conclusions for non-technical reasons (0/3 pts)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

**B. Breadth of Coverage (3/5 pts)**

1. *Applies to political appointees and senior managers (3/3 pts)*

Yes.

2. *Applies to contractors, states, and other partners (0/2 pts)*

No.

**C. Whistleblower Protection (0/12 pts)**

1. *Explicitly protects those filing misconduct complaints from retaliation (0/4 pts)*

No. Department of Energy ensures only “appropriate protections under law and Departmental policy.”

2. *Protects scientists for retaliation based on content of work (4 pts)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

3. *Provides that agency officials who engage in retaliation will be subject to discipline (4 pts)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

**D. Investigations of Complaints (0/6 pts)**

1. *Defined process (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

2. *Timelines (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

3. *Ability of complainant to respond (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

4. *Transparency of findings and rationale (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

5. *Relationship with the IG is clearly defined (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

E. Investigation Independent from Chain of Command (0/6 pts)

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

F. Sanctions for Misconduct (0/6 pts)

1. *States that misconduct is grounds for disciplinary action or dismissal (2 pts)*

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

2. *Explicit procedure for discipline of sustained misconduct complaints (2 pts)*

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

3. *Automatic review of court rulings based upon arbitrary and capricious application of scientific information or scientific findings (2 pts)*

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

**II. Public Communications of Science – (14/40 pts)**

A. Process for scientist to publish or lecture regarding their official work with the general public, in external peer-reviewed journals or at scientific conferences (2/10 pts)

Scientists may speak with the media regarding their work, publish, and present “with appropriate coordination with their immediate supervisor and their public affairs office.”

B. Absence of policy review or agency screening for the above (2/10 pts)

“In no circumstance may public affairs officers ask or direct Federal scientists to alter scientific findings.” Only two points were awarded because this does not address suppression by supervisors.

C. Ability of scientists to review press releases regarding their work prior to final publication (0/10 pts)

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

D. Explicit provision for agency scientists to be on governing and editorial boards of scientific societies (10/10 pts)

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy provides that scientists employed directly as Federal employees may "fully" participate in professional societies subject to Federal ethical regulations.

**III. Transparency of Agency Decision-Making – (5/20 pts)**

A. Requirement that all agency policy decisions must be based on science subjected to external peer review (5/10 pts)

Independent peer review will be conducted where "feasible and appropriate."

B. Original research documents are part of administrative record (0/10 pts)

The Department of Energy's Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.