<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scientific Integrity Grading Rubric</th>
<th>Total Possible: 100 Points</th>
<th>Total Awarded: 25 Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scientific Misconduct</strong></td>
<td>Subsection Total: 40</td>
<td>Subsection Total: 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Political Manipulation of Science</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Breadth of Coverage</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Whistleblower Protection</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Investigations of Complaints</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Investigation Independent from Chain of Command</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Sanctions for Misconduct</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public Communications of Science</strong></td>
<td>Subsection Total: 40</td>
<td>Subsection Total: 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Process for scientist to publish or lecture regarding their official work with the general public, in external peer-reviewed journals or at scientific conferences</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Absence of policy review or agency screening for the above</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Ability of scientists to review press releases regarding their work prior to final publication</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Explicit provision for agency scientists to be on governing and editorial boards of scientific societies</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transparency of Policy Decision-Making</strong></td>
<td>Subsection Total: 20</td>
<td>Subsection Total: 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Requirement that all agency policy decisions must be based on science subjected to external peer review</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Original research documents are part of administrative record</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I. **Scientific Misconduct** – (6/40 pts)

A. **Political Manipulation of Science** (3/6 pts)
   1. *Prohibits alteration of technical/scientific documents for non-technical reasons* (3/3 pts)
      
      “Political officials will not suppress or alter scientific or technological findings”
   
   2. *Prohibits intimidation or coercion to alter scientific data/analysis/conclusions for non-technical reasons* (0/3 pts)
      
      The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

B. **Breadth of Coverage** (3/5 pts)
   1. *Applies to political appointees and senior managers* (3/3 pts)
      
      Yes.
   
   2. *Applies to contractors, states, and other partners* (0/2 pts)
      
      No.

C. **Whistleblower Protection** (0/12 pts)
   1. *Explicitly protects those filing misconduct complaints from retaliation* (0/4 pts)
      
      No. Department of Energy ensures only “appropriate protections under law and Departmental policy.”
   
   2. *Protects scientists for retaliation based on content of work* (4 pts)
      
      The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.
   
   3. *Provides that agency officials who engage in retaliation will be subject to discipline* (4 pts)
      
      The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

D. **Investigations of Complaints** (0/6 pts)
   1. *Defined process* (1 pt)
      
      The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.
   
   2. *Timelines* (1 pt)
      
      The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.
3. *Ability of complainant to respond (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

4. *Transparency of findings and rationale (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

5. *Relationship with the IG is clearly defined (1 pt)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

E. **Investigation Independent from Chain of Command (0/6 pts)**

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

F. **Sanctions for Misconduct (0/6 pts)**

1. *States that misconduct is grounds for disciplinary action or dismissal (2 pts)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

2. *Explicit procedure for discipline of sustained misconduct complaints (2 pts)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

3. *Automatic review of court rulings based upon arbitrary and capricious application of scientific information or scientific findings (2 pts)*

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.

II. **Public Communications of Science – (14/40 pts)**

A. **Process for scientist to publish or lecture regarding their official work with the general public, in external peer-reviewed journals or at scientific conferences (2/10 pts)**

Scientists may speak with the media regarding their work, publish, and present “with appropriate coordination with their immediate supervisor and their public affairs office.”

B. **Absence of policy review or agency screening for the above (2/10 pts)**

“In no circumstance may public affairs officers ask or direct Federal scientists to alter scientific findings.” Only two points were awarded because this does not address suppression by supervisors.

C. **Ability of scientists to review press releases regarding their work prior to final publication (0/10 pts)**

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.
D. **Explicit provision for agency scientists to be on governing and editorial boards of scientific societies** (10/10 pts)

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy provides that scientists employed directly as Federal employees may “fully” participate in professional societies subject to Federal ethical regulations.

**III. Transparency of Agency Decision-Making – (5/20 pts)**

A. **Requirement that all agency policy decisions must be based on science subjected to external peer review** (5/10 pts)

Independent peer review will be conducted where “feasible and appropriate.”

B. **Original research documents are part of administrative record** (0/10 pts)

The Department of Energy’s Scientific Integrity Policy does not address this.